SYSTEMS APPRAISAL FEEDBACK REPORT

in response to the Systems Portfolio of

BAY DE NOC COMMUNITY COLLEGE

September 20, 2011



30 North LaSalle Street, Suite 2400 Chicago, Illinois 60602-2504 www.AQIP.org AQIP@hlcommission.org 800-621-7440

SYSTEMS APPRAISAL FEEDBACK REPORT In response to the Systems Portfolio of BAY DE NOC COMMUNITY COLLEGE



September 20, 2011

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	1
Elements of the Feedback Report	4
Strategic and Accreditation Issues	6
Using the Feedback Report	8
Critical Characteristics Analysis	9
Category Feedback	12
Helping Students Learn	12
Accomplishing Other Distinctive Objectives	16
Understanding Students' and Other Stakeholders' Needs	19
Valuing People	22
Leading and Communicating	25
Supporting Institutional Operations	29
Measuring Effectiveness	31
Planning Continuous Improvement	34
Building Collaborative Relationships	36

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY FOR BAY DE NOC COMMUNITY COLLEGE

The following are summary comments on each of the AQIP Categories crafted by the Appraisal Team to highlight **Bay de Noc Community College**'s achievements and to identify challenges yet to be met.

- (Category 1) Bay College's commitment to student learning is clearly demonstrated by identifying student success as a key part of its strategic vision; by participating in Achieving the Dream; and by improving the placement of entering students, transitional programs, and advising and orientation programs. The Portfolio describes well-developed, if traditional, processes for program and course development and discontinuation, and for faculty evaluation and professional development. However, Bay College has not responded adequately to the accreditation issue from the previous Systems Appraisal Feedback Report, as they still apparently lack specified student learning outcomes for all instructional programs. In addition, Bay College has an opportunity to incorporate direct measures of student learning, as well as to enhance systematic procedures for collecting and analyzing the data.
- (Category 2) With clear objectives and measurements, Bay College presents evidence
 of strong commitment to the community through non-instructional programs and
 services. Recent strategic planning provides a good foundation for prioritizing,
 documenting, and meeting the strategic priority of Community Success. Despite
 decreased fiscal and human resources in economically challenging times, the College
 continues to lead in regional workforce and economic development. Bay College has
 opportunities to expand alumni programs and to develop systematic data collection,
 analysis, and benchmarking processes for evaluating non-instructional outcomes.
- (Category 3) Bay College presents evidence of a campus culture that supports collaborative and evidence-based continuous improvement. The Portfolio indicates that Bay College is completing regular assessments of student needs and student satisfaction, and then using those data to make decisions and improvements. Responses on student satisfaction survey items are generally better than those for peer institutions. The process is less developed for the needs of other institutional stakeholders. Bay College has an opportunity to show improvement through

- establishing a more formal and proactive process for collecting, analyzing and monitoring data regarding the needs of external stakeholders.
- (Category 4) As evidenced by the number of established and developing processes
 related to Valuing People, Bay College has demonstrated its willingness to develop and
 assess its processes and use the results to make improvements. The most notable
 example is the substantial increase in the amount of professional development. Further
 opportunities would includes systematizing processes, using additional instruments,
 developing measures of process effectiveness, linking productivity to organizational goal
 attainment, and benchmarking.
- (Category 5) Bay College has formal and informal processes in place that facilitate bidirectional communication and foster shared leadership, as evidenced by the new strategic planning process. The College has used student and employee satisfaction data to assist in monitoring its improvement. Comparisons to other institutions, documentation of changes made and their resulting impact on surveys, systematic processes for data collection and analysis, and locating data in an accessible, central location could strengthen results and confirm for College leaders when benchmarked goals are met. Although means of information dissemination have been improved, there remains an opportunity to make processes more clear and transparent and to better communicate institutional progress toward the strategic agenda in a periodic and timely manner. Finally, a leadership succession plan would strengthen the institution.
- (Category 6) Bay College has identified student success as one of its highest strategic priorities, and it has demonstrated this commitment by regularly gathering student satisfaction data and by making improvements in its programs; an example would be the attention given to student orientation and advising. At the same time, however, Bay College recognizes that it does not have adequate processes or data regarding administrative and organizational support services. A more systematic and intentional process of data gathering and analysis would be valuable in the institution's efforts to improve quality.
- (Category 7) Participating in the Achieving the Dream program has enabled Bay
 College to enhance its data collection and analysis concerning institutional effectiveness.
 The College recognizes the need for even more data collection and analysis as it seeks

continuous quality improvement in this area. Developing systematic processes to measure effectiveness is an important step in their quality journey and would serve to drive a cycle of continuous quality improvement. In particular, there is an important opportunity to include the instructional departments in the effort to measure effectiveness.

- (Category 8) Bay College recently engaged in an important strategic planning process and began developing measures to assess the effectiveness of the process. Thus, the College is in the developmental stages of creating the infrastructure to measure, evaluate, and improve its planning processes. Process improvements have been made, and initial assessments suggest that the new system for planning and progress evaluation is working. An opportunity may exist, however, in that this category of the Portfolio included virtually no mention of how Bay College has applied these planning and evaluation processes in instructional and academic areas. The Portfolio describes several instances of evaluation and planning processes focused on student service/support areas; extending application of these processes to academics would benefit the core function of the College. There are also opportunities to continue gathering and analyzing evaluative data on a more strategic basis, and using the resulting information as a foundation for planning and goal alignment.
- (Category 9) Located in a small community of Michigan's Upper Peninsula, Bay College is both advantaged and challenged in building collaborative relationships. The small size of the campus and its surrounding community engender cooperative relationships, as well as a friendly, welcoming campus culture. However, the "field" of potential partners may be more limited. The College has certainly made the most of its opportunities to establish mutually beneficial, productive relationships with educational, commercial, and civic partners. Opportunities for improvement in this area are primarily in developing methods of prioritizing relationship possibilities and in identifying reliable and valid measures of performance results from these relationships. Such measures would be valuable not only to Bay College, but to the community.

Accreditation issues and Strategic challenges for Bay de Noc Community College are listed in detail within the Strategic and Accreditation Issues Analysis section of the Appraisal Feedback Report.

ELEMENTS OF Bay de Noc Community College's FEEDBACK REPORT

The *Systems Appraisal Feedback Report* provides AQIP's official response to your *Systems Portfolio* by a team of readers trained in evaluation. After appraisers independently reviewed your document, the team reached consensus on essential elements of your institutional profile, strengths and opportunities for improvement by Category, and significant issues for your institution. These are presented in three sections of the Feedback Report: Accreditation Issues Analysis, Critical Characteristics Analysis, and Category Feedback. These components are interrelated in defining context, evaluating performance, surfacing critical issues, and assessing institutional performance.

It is important to remember that the Systems Appraisal Team had only your *Systems Portfolio* to guide their analysis of your institution's strengths and opportunities for improvement. Consequently, their report may omit important strengths — if you were too modest to stress them in your *Systems Portfolio*, or if your discussion and documentation of them was unconvincing. Similarly, the team may have pointed out areas of potential improvement that are already receiving the institution's attention. Again, the team used its best judgment in identifying improvement opportunities. If some of these areas of potential improvement are now strengths rather than opportunities because of your own focused efforts, that is all to your credit. If the team was unsure about an area, we urged it to err on the side of giving your institution the best possible advice about where investing your efforts might pay off. If some of their advice comes after the fact, after you've already tackled an area, no harm is done.

Executive Summary: Summative statements agreed upon by the Systems Appraisal Team reflecting the reviewers' assessment of the institution's current status in relation to critical quality characteristics: robustness of process design; utilization or deployment of processes; the existence of results, trends, and comparative data; the use of results data as feedback, and systematic processes for improvement of the activities that the Category covers. Since institutions are complex, maturity levels may vary from one Category to another.

Strategic challenges for the institution are listed in detail within the Strategic and Accreditation Issues Analysis section of the Appraisal Feedback Report.

Strategic and Accreditation Issues Analysis: Strategic issues are those most closely related to your institution's ability to succeed in reaching its mission, planning, and quality improvement goals. Accreditation issues are areas where you have not yet provided evidence that you meet the Commission's *Criteria for Accreditation*, or where the evidence you have presented suggests you may have difficulties, now or in the future, in meeting these expectations. If accreditation is essential for your institution then any accreditation issues identified are, by definition, also strategic. The Systems Appraisal Team identified both of these kinds of issues through analysis of your Organizational Overview and the feedback it provided for each Category, as well as by reviewing the Index to the *Criteria for Accreditation* that you provided along with your *Systems Portfolio*. This list of strategic issues offers a framework for addressing ongoing improvement of processes and systems, serving as an executive summary of the Report's key findings and recommendations.

Critical Characteristics: Your Systems Portfolio's Organizational Overview provides context for the team's knowledge of your institution's identity, mission objectives, strategic goals, and key factors related to improvement. Critical Characteristics are those features most important for understanding the institution's mission, environment, stakeholders, competitive position, goals, and processes. Characteristics having the greatest relevance to each Category are identified in the Report.

Category Feedback: The Report's feedback on each of AQIP's nine Categories specifically identifies strengths and opportunities for improvement. An **S** or **SS** identifies strengths, with the double letter signifying important achievements or capabilities upon which to build. Opportunities are designated by **O**, with **OO** indicating areas where attention may result in more significant improvement. Comments, which are keyed to your *Systems Portfolio*, offer brief analysis of each strength and opportunity. Organized by Category, and presenting the team's findings in detail, this section is the heart of the Report.

STRATEGIC AND ACCREDITATION ISSUES

In conducting the Systems Appraisal, the team attempted to identify the broader issues that present the greatest challenges and opportunities for your institution in the coming years. These are all strategic issues, ones you need to grapple with as you identify your institution's strategies for confronting the future and becoming the institution you want to be. The team also examined whether any of these strategic issues put your institution into jeopardy of not meeting the Higher Learning Commission's accreditation expectations.

Issues Affecting Compliance with the *Criteria for Accreditation*. An important goal for the Systems Appraisal was to review your institution's compliance with the Higher Learning Commission's *Criteria for Accreditation*. The peer quality experts who served on the team were all trained in evaluating colleges and universities using the Commission's *Criteria*, and the Systems Appraisal process they followed included careful steps to ensure the team used the *Criteria* as a major factor in their review. As the team reviewed your presentation of your institution's systems and processes under each AQIP Category, it searched for accreditation-related issues and concerns. In addition, the team used the *Index to the Criteria for Accreditation* that you provided with your Portfolio to perform a comprehensive review of the *Criteria* and each Core Component to ascertain whether you presented compelling evidence that your institution complies with each of these Commission expectations.

The Systems Appraisal team has identified gaps in the evidence Bay de Noc Community College has presented to demonstrate that it complies with the Five *Criteria for Accreditation*. In the team's judgment, areas exist where you have *not yet* provided evidence that you meet one or more Core Components of the Commission's Five *Criteria for Accreditation*, or where the evidence you have presented suggests you might have difficulties, now or in the future, in meeting these expectations. The team is not suggesting that you currently fail to comply with the *Criteria*, but simply that you need to present additional evidence of compliance prior to the Commission's next scheduled AQIP review of your institution for Reaffirmation of Accreditation. AQIP will provide you with courses of action you can follow to provide this additional assurance. The issues regarding accreditation that the team identified are:

A1 Accreditation Criterion Three focuses on Student Learning and Effective Teaching. As part of that criterion, Core Component 3a describes the following expectation: "The organization's goals for student learning outcomes are clearly stated for each educational program and make effective assessment possible."

The Portfolio provides evidence that Bay College has developed learning outcomes for General Education and for some occupational programs but has not yet developed outcomes for non-occupational programs and some occupational programs. Although the Portfolio provides an explanation for the delay in developing learning outcomes for all educational programs, the Systems Appraisal Team also notes that the same accreditation issue was raised in the 2007 Systems Appraisal Feedback Report. The College has had several years to address this important concern and has provided only a partial response. Without clear and measurable learning objectives for all educational programs, the institution is unable to assess the effectiveness of those programs and to engage in continuous quality improvement.

Issues Affecting Future Institutional Strategies. The Systems Appraisal Team identified the following strategic issues to assist Bay de Noc Community College in prioritizing and taking action on the important broad challenges and opportunities it faces. From these you may discover your vital immediate priorities, shaping strategies that can lead to a quantum leap in the performance of your institution. Implementing these strategies may call for specific actions, so AQIP's expectation that your institution be engaged in three or four vital Action Projects at all times will help encourage your administrators, faculty, and staff to turn these strategic goals into real accomplishments. Knowing that Bay de Noc Community College will discuss these strategic issues, give priority to those it concludes are most critical, and take action promptly, the Systems Appraisal Team identified:

• Since the last Systems Appraisal, Bay College has taken a number of important steps to gather and use data for institutional improvement, including in some cases comparative and longitudinal data. The Portfolio makes clear, however, that more progress is needed in several areas. The College recognizes many of these opportunities including, for example, data about administrative and organizational support services, data about the perceptions of external stakeholders, and data about the effectiveness of collaborative relationships with external organizations. In addition, the College has an

opportunity to further expand and refine its processes for systematically and intentionally gathering, analyzing, and using data. Establishing performance targets and comparative benchmarks would be helpful in using data to identify opportunities for continuous improvement. Going beyond perceptual data or satisfaction data to more direct measures of effectiveness would be helpful in identifying opportunities for improvement. More complex data analysis, including issues surrounding the validity and reliability of surveys and the statistical significance of survey results, would be helpful in understanding and using data about programs and services.

- The Review Team notes that several portions of the Portfolio focus on assessment and improvements to administrative and organizational programs but provide little or no information about systematic assessment and improvements in instructional programs.
 Examples include Categories 7 (Measuring Effectiveness) and 8 (Planning Continuous Improvement).
- The Portfolio provides little or no information about the institution's leadership succession plan. This was also noted in the 2007 Systems Appraisal Feedback Report. Although the College has not recently encountered instability in its leadership, the development of a succession plan will enable the institution to address challenges that may arise.
- With a relatively new strategic plan, Bay College has worked to enhance the alignment
 of its strategic plan with departmental planning, as well as with program and personnel
 evaluation. In the area of strategic planning, the College has an opportunity to further
 identify and articulate its strategic priorities in developing external partnerships and to
 develop strategies that would foster greater alignment between its curricular and cocurricular programs.

USING THE FEEDBACK REPORT

The AQIP Systems Appraisal Feedback Report is intended to initiate action for improvement. It is therefore important that the Report produced by the Systems Appraisal Team stimulate review of organizational processes and systems. Though decisions about specific actions are each institution's, AQIP expects every institution to use its feedback to stimulate cycles of

continual improvement. At the next Strategy Forum an AQIP institution attends, its peers will examine in detail how it is using the feedback from its Systems Appraisal.

An organization needs to examine its Report strategically to identify those areas that will yield greatest benefit if addressed. Some key questions that may arise in careful examination of the Report may be: How do the team's findings challenge our assumptions about ourselves? Given our mission and goals, which issues should we focus on? How will we employ results to innovate, grow, and encourage a positive culture of improvement? How will we incorporate lessons learned from this review in our planning and operational processes? How will we revise the *Systems Portfolio* to reflect what we have learned?

How an organization interprets, communicates, and uses its feedback for improvement ought to support AQIP's core values, encouraging involvement, learning, collaboration and integrity. Based solely upon an organization's *Systems Portfolio*, the Report reflects a disciplined, external review of what an organization says about itself. The report should help an organization identify ways to improve its *Systems Portfolio* so it functions better to communicate accurately to internal and external audiences. But the Report's chief purpose is to help you to identify areas for improvement, and to act so that these areas actually improve. These improvements can then be incorporated into an updated *Systems Portfolio*, guaranteeing that future Systems Appraisals will reflect the progress an institution has made.

Within a year following the Systems Appraisal, an institution participates in another AQIP Strategy Forum, where the focus will be on what the institution has learned from its Appraisal (and from its other methods of identifying and prioritizing improvement opportunities, and what it has concluded are its major strategic priorities for the next few years. AQIP's goal is to help an institution to clarify the strategic issues most vital to its success, and then to support the institution as it addresses these priorities through Action Projects that will make a difference in institutional performance.

CRITICAL CHARACTERISTICS ANALYSIS

The purpose of this section is to identify what team members understood to be the critical and distinguishing characteristics of your institution. They are the shared understanding of the most important aspects of Bay de Noc Community College, its current dynamics and the forces

surrounding it, and its internal momentum and aspirations, at least as team members understood them. This section also demonstrates that the Systems Appraisal Team recognized and knew what makes Bay de Noc Community College distinctive. Should you find some characteristics that you think are critical and missing from this list, you may want to clarify and highlight these items when you revise your *Systems Portfolio* and other literature explaining your institution to the public.

Item Critical Characteristic

- OVa Bay de Noc Community College is a public, comprehensive, two-year institution founded in 1962, serving five counties in the Upper Peninsula of Michigan. The College has a 150-acre campus in Escanaba and a second campus in Iron Mountain with a new 67,000 square foot facility.
- OVb Bay College is funded by state appropriations, variable local tax levies, and variable student tuition rates. Bay College is governed by a seven member Board of Trustees, elected by the citizens of Delta County and responsible for setting area-wide college policy.
- OVc Bay College's mission is to provide quality learning opportunities that enable its students to succeed and its communities to thrive. The College recently completed a strategic planning cycle and identified three strategic priorities: student success, community success, and a culture of success.
- OV1a Bay College offers 14 certificate programs and 24 associate programs, with the largest enrollments in areas of health care and liberal arts. The College is organized into six academic divisions: Allied Health and Wellness, Arts and Letters, Business, Math and Science, Social and Behavioral Sciences, and Technology.
- OV1b Bay College's student body has grown substantially in recent years to approximately 2,800 students; 58% attend full-time, 95% are Caucasian, 61% are female, 51% are of nontraditional age, and 72% are Pell Grant recipients. Approximately 25% of the duplicated headcount are enrolled in online classes.
- OV1c Bay College participates in Achieving the Dream, a national organization focusing on student success, and the College offers a range of programs and resources for student success including Title III, TRiO, intrusive student advising, and tutoring.

- OV2a The Advancement Office, including the Bay College Foundation, and the Workforce Development division, which oversees the Michigan Technical Education Center (M-TEC), provide important internal and external programs and services.
- OV2b Bay College partners with its area communities in many ways, including four public art galleries, a theater for community productions, and athletic facilities.
- OV3 The three state institutions that compete for students are not within easy commuting distance of Bay College, while a Wisconsin technical college is located within an hour's drive from the Bay College West campus. The College also reports that it competes for students with online institutions and the military.
- OV4 Bay College employs 49 full-time faculty and 116 part-time faculty, each represented by a collective bargaining unit. Bay College has 41 exempt and 46 non-exempt staff, as well as 15 Supplemental Instructors/Learning Assistants. Administrators and staff are organized into seven functional areas.
- OV5 The primary decision-making body is the President's Advisory Council (PAC), consisting of the President, area administrators, and three academic deans. Bay College reports a highly participative leadership culture, with several cross-functional committees such as the Instructional Leadership Team and the AtD Core Team.
- OV6 Bay College enhances student success through an extensive orientation program for new students, supplemental instruction, intrusive advising, the Learning Resource Center, the Student Success Office, the TRiO Center, and the Math/Science Center.
- OV7 Bay College is currently upgrading its enterprise resource planning system with a new commercial product, which will enhance information storage, access, analysis, and reporting.
- OV8 Regional and state economic conditions have constrained Bay College's financial, human, and physical resources, while at the same time increasing stakeholder demand for its programs and services.
- OV9 Bay College has strategically developed partnerships with several community organizations, including the Upper Peninsula Center for Educational Development (UPCED), K-12 schools, and a Local College Access Network (LCAN).

CATEGORY FEEDBACK

In the following sections, each of which deals with strengths and opportunities for improvement for one of the nine AQIP Categories, selected *Critical Characteristics* are again highlighted, those the Systems Appraisal Team believed were critical keys to reviewing that particular AQIP Category. The symbols used in these "strengths and opportunities" sections for each Category stand for *outstanding strength* (SS), *strength* (S), *opportunity for improvement* (O) and *pressing or outstanding opportunity for improvement* (OO). The choice of symbol for each item represents the consensus evaluation of the Systems Appraisal Team members, and deserves your thoughtful consideration. Comments marked SS or OO may need immediate attention, either to ensure the institution preserves and maximizes the value of its greatest strengths, or to devote immediate attention to its greatest opportunities for improvement.

AQIP CATEGORY 1: HELPING STUDENTS LEARN

Helping Students Learn identifies the shared purpose of all higher education organizations, and is accordingly the pivot of any institutional analysis. This Category focuses on the teaching-learning process within a formal instructional context, yet also addresses how your entire institution contributes to helping students learn and overall student development. It examines your institution's processes and systems related to learning objectives, mission-driven student learning and development, intellectual climate, academic programs and courses, student preparation, key issues such as technology and diversity, program and course delivery, faculty and staff roles, teaching and learning effectiveness, course sequencing and scheduling, learning and co-curricular support, student assessment, measures, analysis of results, and efforts to continuously improve these areas.

Here are the Key Critical Characteristics of Bay de Noc Community College that were identified by the Systems Appraisal Team as most relevant for its interpretation of its Systems Portfolio section covering Category 1, Helping Students Learn:

Item Critical Characteristic

OVc Bay College's mission is to provide quality learning opportunities that enable its students to succeed and its communities to thrive. The College recently completed a strategic

- planning cycle and identified three strategic priorities: student success, community success, and a culture of success.
- OV1a Bay College offers 14 certificate programs and 24 associate programs, with the largest enrollments in areas of health care and liberal arts. The College is organized into six academic divisions: Allied Health and Wellness, Arts and Letters, Business, Math and Science, Social and Behavioral Sciences, and Technology.
- OV1b The Bay College student body has grown substantially in recent years to approximately 2,800 students; 58% attend full-time, 95% are Caucasian, 61% are female, 51% are of nontraditional age, and 72% are Pell Grant recipients. Approximately 25% of the duplicated headcount are enrolled in on-line classes.
- OV1c Bay College participates in Achieving the Dream, a national organization focusing on student success, and the College offers a range of programs and resources for student success including Title III, TRiO, intrusive student advising, and tutoring.

Here are what the Systems Appraisal Team identified as Bay de Noc Community College's most important strengths and opportunities for improvement relating to processes encompassed by Category 1, Helping Students Learn.

Item	S/O	Comment
1P1	S	General education outcomes are determined collaboratively by the Bay College General Education Team, with all full-time faculty voting on the final proposal.
1P2	00	In response to its last Systems Portfolio appraisal, Bay College has developed learning outcomes for some occupational programs using input from a variety of stakeholders. However, Bay College has not developed learning outcomes for non-occupational programs or for some occupational programs. Accreditation Criterion 3, Student Learning and Effective Teaching, specifies that student learning outcomes are to be developed for each program.
1P3	S	Bay College has established a thorough process for new program development, using input from various stakeholders. The process has

		checks and balances to ensure that new programs are viable and sustainable.
1P4	S	Bay College has well-developed processes for partnering with local businesses and industries to design programs that will prepare students for the workforce.
1P5,1P7	S	Bay College helps students select programs that match their needs, Interests and abilities through a robust program of academic advising, with ready access to professional advisors and faculty advisors. There is also a rich program of career advising resources, reflecting the recent hire of a full-time career advisor. Bay College assesses the level of student preparedness through the ACT and COMPASS, and the College has examined correlations between students' placement scores and their academic readiness.
1P8a	SS	Title III funding and participation in the Achieving the Dream program have assisted Bay College in addressing the challenges associated with serving underprepared students. Recent improvements include hiring instructors, forming the Transitional Studies Committee, integrating developmental courses, and implementing FY 101.
1P8b	0	It is not clear that Bay College monitors the progress of underprepared students after they complete developmental courses in order to determine their success in college-level courses. This information could facilitate effective planning, intervention and use of resources.
1P9	0	The Portfolio indicates that Bay College does not assess learning styles at the level of individual courses or students. This information could support effective teaching strategies and might enable students to implement effective study and learning practices.
1P10	0	Bay College describes processes and systems for providing reasonable accommodations for students with disabilities. However the Portfolio does not address processes for meeting the needs of other student subgroups such as nontraditional students, seniors, veterans and commuters.

1P12	S	Bay College monitors teaching quality through course evaluations, classroom observations, and a certification process for faculty who teach online.
1P13	0	Bay College has an opportunity to improve course scheduling. Improvements in this area could benefit students, faculty, and advising staff and could promote efficient use of resources.
1P14	S	Bay College has a well-developed program evaluation process and a straightforward process for program discontinuation; these processes draw on multiple indicators as well as input from external stakeholders. Furthermore, Bay College has demonstrated its ability to discontinue programs as needed, while enabling students in these programs to complete their degrees.
1P16	0	While the Portfolio describes activities of student organizations that complement curricula, there is no explanation of ways in which Bay College systematically aligns co-curricular goals with curricular learning outcomes. Alignment could strengthen both academic and co-curricular efforts and enhance the campus community.
1P17a	S	Bay College uses multiple data sources to evaluate success in preparing students for further study and/or employment following graduation.
1P17b	0	The Portfolio does not explain what Bay College does with data describing students' success after graduation, or how these data are used to improve courses and programs.
1P18	0	The Portfolio does not describe how the processes for assessing student learning outcomes are <i>designed</i> , but rather what the current processes are. It is also unclear what purpose each assessment serves, how data are used to improve teaching and learning, or how they align with institutional learning outcomes. Systematic processes that clearly align assessments with learning outcomes could inform curricular and pedagogical improvements.

1R1	0	Bay College uses multiple surveys and key performance indicators; however, the Portfolio provided no evidence of <i>a priori</i> goals guiding their use. Furthermore, the College has an opportunity to use more direct measures of student learning, instead of or in addition to the indirect measures of learning reported in Tables 1-7, 1-8, and 1-9. In addition, the Portfolio states that Bay College "analyzes data as part of its activities
		related to the Achieving the Dream program and Title III grants;" however, it is not always clear whether the analytic approach involves informally looking at data, more complex statistical analysis, or the systematic analysis of benchmarks and/ or trends. Systematic benchmark and trend analyses, if not already in use, could produce more useful information.
1R2	S	Bay College students surpassed national benchmarks in six of seven areas of common learning outcomes, as evidenced through several assessment methods.
1R5	0	Bay College documents that learning support services enjoy high levels of user satisfaction. However, data documenting service <i>effectiveness</i> in promoting student success are not presented. Devising and using reliable and valid measures of effectiveness could not only inform planning at Bay College but also enrich the higher education community.
1R6	S	Bay College compares well with other Midwestern community colleges on three items from the Noel-Levitz Student Satisfaction Inventory.
111	S	Bay College has made recent improvements in Helping Students Learn (e.g., strategic focus on student success; improved use of placement test results; strengthened academic and career advising processes).

AQIP CATEGORY 2: ACCOMPLISHING OTHER DISTINCTIVE OBJECTIVES

Accomplishing Other Distinctive Objectives addresses the processes that contribute to the achievement of your institution's major objectives that complement student learning and fulfill other portions of your mission. Depending on your institution's character, it examines your institution's processes and systems related to identification of other distinctive objectives,

alignment of other distinctive objectives, faculty and staff roles, assessment and review of objectives, measures, analysis of results, and efforts to continuously improve these areas.

Here are the Key Critical Characteristics of Bay de Noc Community College that were identified by the Systems Appraisal Team as most relevant for its interpretation of its Systems Portfolio section covering Category 2, Accomplishing Other Distinctive Objectives:

Item Critical Characteristic

- OVc Bay College's mission is to provide quality learning opportunities that enable its students to succeed and its communities to thrive. The College recently completed a strategic planning cycle and identified three strategic priorities: student success, community success, and a culture of success.
- OV2a The Advancement Office, including the Bay College Foundation, and the Workforce Development division, which oversees the Michigan Technical Education Center (M-TEC), provide important internal and external programs and services.
- OV2b Bay College partners with its area communities in many ways, including four public art galleries, a theater for community productions, and athletic facilities.

Here are what the Systems Appraisal Team identified as Bay de Noc Community College's most important strengths and opportunities for improvement relating to processes encompassed by Category 2, Accomplishing Other Distinctive Objectives.

Item	S/O	Comment
2P1a	S	To meet the needs and expectations of its external constituents, Bay College offers a variety of non-instructional services and programs to support economic development and community enrichment of the service region.
2P1b	0	Bay College recognizes an opportunity to expand alumni programs and services. In addition, there is an opportunity to describe more explicitly the key processes by which non-instructional services are designed and delivered.

2P2	S	The new strategic planning process engages both internal and external stakeholders; campus and community input is used to identify the institutional priority for achieving the goal of Community Success.
2P3	0	Although Bay College uses several means to provide information to employees, it is unclear whether there is a formal written mechanism (for example, a community report card) to communicate with external stakeholders. Establishing a consistent, documented communication plan can build further participation and support from those constituents.
2P4	0	Bay College recognizes the importance of developing formal processes for assessing major non-instructional outcomes. These assessment data could enhance program effectiveness and resource allocation.
2P5	S	Planning processes include a planning template identifying project objectives, timelines, and resource requirements. As a result, the risks of overextending finite resources are minimized.
2R1	0	Although Bay College monitors event attendance, facility usage, and revenue generation, the Portfolio provides little or no data about participant satisfaction, or the effectiveness of its programs and services. These data could be helpful in the College's quality improvement efforts.
2R2a	SS	Engagement with the community has resulted in significant financial support from the community that the College uses for scholarships, facility improvements, and equipment benefitting students.
2R2b	0	The Portfolio states that M-TEC training relies heavily on regional and state economies; thus the number of training sections and participants has decreased recently. The College and M-TEC might consider developing online training programs that could enable expansion beyond the immediate region.
2R2c	Ο	The Portfolio reports performance results regarding the expansion of non-credit offerings, but no results related to the further development of K-20 partnerships or expanded career services. Reporting on only some

		organizational objectives may create a false perception of the relative importance of those objectives.
2R3	Ο	While the Portfolio states that the Office of Institutional Advancement collects performance measures, trend and comparative data are not presented. Comparative data for M-TEC may be difficult to obtain, but perhaps a subset of Michigan data or data from other states could be helpful. Additionally, coordinating efforts with current M-TEC organizations could both extend outreach and provide benchmarking opportunities for all involved.
211	S	The College has improved its communication efficiency through IT upgrades (e.g., VoIP phone system, remote desktop capabilities, and online meeting software).
212	S	Bay College has developed an effective evaluation and goal-setting process that uses templates to assist in aligning individual goals with departmental and institutional goals.

AQIP CATEGORY 3: UNDERSTANDING STUDENTS' AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS' NEEDS

Understanding Students' and Other Stakeholders' Needs examines how your institution works actively to understand student and other stakeholder needs. It examines your institution's processes and systems related to student and stakeholder identification, student and stakeholder requirements, analysis of student and stakeholder needs, relationship building with students and stakeholders, complaint collection, analysis, and resolution, determining satisfaction of students and stakeholders, measures, analysis of results, and efforts to continuously improve these areas.

Here are the Key Critical Characteristics of Bay de Noc Community College that were identified by the Systems Appraisal Team as most relevant for its interpretation of its Systems Portfolio section covering Category 3, Understanding Students' and Other Stakeholders' Needs:

Item Critical Characteristic

- OVb Bay College is funded by state appropriations, variable local tax levies, and variable student tuition rates. Bay College is governed by a seven member Board of Trustees, elected by the citizens of Delta County and responsible for setting area-wide college policy.
- OVc Bay College's mission is to provide quality learning opportunities that enable its students to succeed and its communities to thrive. The College recently completed a strategic planning cycle and identified three strategic priorities: student success, community success, and a culture of success.
- OV1b Bay College's student body has grown substantially in recent years to approximately 2,800 students; 58% attend full-time, 95% are Caucasian, 61% are female, 51% are of nontraditional age, and 72% are Pell Grant recipients. Approximately 25% of the duplicated headcount are enrolled in online classes.
- OV3 The three state institutions that compete for students are not within easy commuting distance of Bay College, while a Wisconsin technical college is located thirty minutes from the Bay College West campus. The College also competes for students with online institutions and the military. s

Here are what the Systems Appraisal Team identified as Bay de Noc Community College's most important strengths and opportunities for improvement relating to processes encompassed by Category 3, Understanding Students' and Other Stakeholders' Needs.

Item S/O Comment

3P1 SS Bay College uses both informal (e.g., individual conversations) and formal (e.g., surveys, placement test results) means to identify students' needs, and engages multiple stakeholders when analyzing and selecting courses of action. Additional data are analyzed within the College's Achieving the Dream initiative, which has produced multiple years of data available for trend analysis. With this portfolio of information and commitment to using that information, the College is well-positioned to understand students' needs.

3P2a	S	Bay College cites several activities to build and maintain relationships with students.
3P2b	0	The Portfolio does not describe a <i>process</i> for actively building and maintaining relationships with students from the student's initial inquiry through graduation. A thoughtful strategy for building and maintaining relationships with students may improve retention and completion rates.
3P5	S	The academic leadership, the PAC, and the Board of Trustees make decisions about marketing to new stakeholder groups based on the mission, available resources, and impact on existing stakeholders. The Portfolio describes several instances in which the process resulted in such targeting and how College operations were impacted.
3P6	O	Bay de Noc collects stakeholder feedback via Idea Boxes. Although complaints are reviewed monthly by the PAC, it is unclear whether a documented and transparent process exists for resolving or prioritizing faculty and staff complaints. Establishing clear, consistent processes for responding to complaints would promote consistency and communication in this area.
3R1a	SS	Bay collects student satisfaction data through multiple survey instruments, including SSI, CCSSE, SENSE, Graduate Follow-up Surveys, and student course evaluations. Additionally, focus groups are used to gather feedback on specific topics. SSI data have been compared over time to review trends and seek to address lower scores. Gap analyses are used to identify areas of concern.
3R1b	0	Recent SSI data reveal opportunities for improvement in advising, career services, internships, and timely notification of academic difficulties.
3R4	0	Evidence regarding external stakeholder satisfaction is largely informal and sporadic. The College has an opportunity to formalize feedback from stakeholder groups such as employers, community members, and alumni. This information could enable Bay College to clearly identify trends towards (or away from) improvement and promote effective allocation of resources.

3R5	0	The Portfolio presents a list of "partners" and describes the processes
		through which the College forms new relationships. However, the
		Portfolio does not describe a means for assessing efficiency or
		effectiveness in building external relationships. By establishing
		measurable, attainable performance outcomes (e.g., numbers of new
		advisory committee members, new donors, new internships/coops, etc.),
		Bay College will be able to demonstrate effectiveness in this area.
3R6	Ο	Obtaining benchmarking data for external stakeholders will help provide
		context for the efficiency of its processes for understanding and
		addressing the needs of external stakeholders.
3I1-2	S	Both qualitative and quantitative data (including faculty input) are valued
		in Bay College's culture when addressing organizational change. The
		College has developed and improved processes to identify and meet
		stakeholder needs, particularly for students. There is clear evidence of
		support for collaborative and evidence-based continuous improvement in
		understanding stakeholder needs. Recent improvements include student
		focus groups to improve orientation, a student panel focused on entering
		student experiences during in-service, a streamlined and more
		personalized advising process, and improved collection and review of
		student survey and longitudinal performance data.

AQIP CATEGORY 4: VALUING PEOPLE

Valuing People explores your institution's commitment to the development of your employees since the efforts of all of your faculty, staff, and administrators are required for institutional success. It examines your institution's processes and systems related to work and job environment; workforce needs; training initiatives; job competencies and characteristics; recruitment, hiring, and retention practices; work processes and activities; training and development; personnel evaluation; recognition, reward, compensation, and benefits; motivation factors; satisfaction, health and safety, and well-being; measures; analysis of results; and efforts to continuously improve these areas.

Here are the Key Critical Characteristics of Bay de Noc Community College that were identified by the Systems Appraisal Team as most relevant for its interpretation of its Systems Portfolio section covering Category 4, Valuing People:

Item Critical Characteristic

S/O

Comment

Item

- OVc Bay College's mission is to provide quality learning opportunities that enable its students to succeed and its communities to thrive. The College recently completed a strategic planning cycle and identified three strategic priorities: student success, community success, and a culture of success.
- OV4 Bay College employs 49 full-time faculty and 116 part-time faculty, each represented by a collective bargaining unit. Bay College has 41 exempt and 46 non-exempt staff, as well as 15 Supplemental Instructors/Learning Assistants. Administrators and staff are organized into seven functional areas.

Here are what the Systems Appraisal Team identified as Bay de Noc Community College's most important strengths and opportunities for improvement relating to processes encompassed by Category 4, Valuing People.

	0, 0	
4P1a	S	Bay College's hiring policy and processes are designed to ensure a thorough assessment of candidates' qualifications. Vacancy announcements are created by employees familiar with the position and with institutional requirements. Providing candidates with information about the College prior to interview, and interview itineraries that introduce Bay College's distinctive culture and environment, appear to
		optimize fit between the College and the new hires.
4P1b, 4P5	00	Position descriptions are reviewed only when a position is vacated or considered for reclassification; this practice can result in confusion regarding expectations if there are undocumented changes in duties. Succession planning is ad hoc, and former employees are sometimes asked to return to train successors. Bay College has an opportunity to proactively develop a succession planning process that includes regular review of staffing needs and job descriptions.

4P4	S	Based on the strategic agenda and employee feedback, Bay College has a new employee orientation program that communicates the strategic agenda to new employees. This program contributes to a shared understanding of institutional values, mission and history.
4P6	0	Going beyond improvements already made (e.g., organization chart, enterprise resource planning system), there is an opportunity to develop or restructure other processes to increase institutional efficiency and to avoid work silos.
4P7	0	Processes for ensuring ethical behavior are not described in the Portfolio; the College appears to rely mainly on employees' ethical compasses. Bay College has an opportunity to assist employees in remaining current with ethical and legal standards by developing policies and training opportunities.
4P8	S	Bay College has improved its process for identifying professional development needs through the Employee Satisfaction Survey (ESS) and the annual goal-setting process. With both institution-wide and individually-tailored development opportunities, Bay College increases the likelihood that all employees will enhance their skills on an ongoing basis.
4P9	0	While it is clear that professional development occurs regularly, the Portfolio does not describe how the training aligns with institutional objectives or whether the training yields the intended results at the individual and organizational levels.
4P10	0	Bay College has a performance appraisal system in place; however, the efficacy of the system may be compromised because appraisal cycles are based on hire dates rather than an organizational timeline. In addition, the Portfolio does not explain if, when, or how part-time employees are evaluated. Establishing an all-encompassing system with a common timeline could enable Bay College to efficiently secure data for decisions regarding training, workload distribution, budget, and goal alignment.
4R1	Ο	There is an opportunity to use additional survey instruments to validate the ESS and provide additional insights. Furthermore, statistical analyses

of ESS data could indicate whether year-to-year fluctuations are meaningful and thus call for intervention. Similarly, disaggregating data could reveal whether differences in satisfaction exist among employee groups and/or campus locations.

S Bay College annually collects information through the ESS; survey results suggest that Bay College provides a satisfying work environment for full-time employees. Survey results are used to identify action projects for the coming years.

OO Bay College recognizes the opportunity to gather and use employee productivity evidence in its evaluation and improvement efforts.

Examples of possible measures include student admission and retention rates; student, alumni, and employer satisfaction rates; and numbers of community partnerships. In addition, there may be an opportunity to develop greater linkages between employee productivity, individual and departmental goals, and the institution's strategic agenda.

O Bay College recognizes an opportunity to build on the successes of the Achieving the Dream program and to improve systematic processes in this category. One approach to creating a culture of systematic quality improvement is to align processes with AQIP categories, and charge oversight committees with reviewing data, identifying areas of concern, and developing solutions. Review of the HLC Action Project Directory and the "Valuing People" section of the Innovation Exchange may also be of benefit.

AQIP CATEGORY 5: LEADING AND COMMUNICATING

4R3

Leading And Communicating addresses how your institution's leadership and communication structures, networks, and processes guide your institution in setting directions, making decisions, seeking future opportunities, and building and sustaining a learning environment. It examines your institution's processes and systems related to leading activities, communicating activities, alignment of leadership system practices, institutional values and expectations,

direction setting, future opportunity seeking, decision making, use of data, leadership development and sharing, succession planning, measures, analysis of results, and efforts to continuously improve these areas.

Here are the Key Critical Characteristics of Bay de Noc Community College that were identified by the Systems Appraisal Team as most relevant for its interpretation of its Systems Portfolio section covering Category 5, Leading and Communicating:

Item Critical Characteristic

- OVb Bay College is funded by state appropriations, variable local tax levies, and variable student tuition rates. Bay College is governed by a seven member Board of Trustees, elected by the citizens of Delta County and responsible for setting area-wide college policy.
- OVc Bay College's mission is to provide quality learning opportunities that enable its students to succeed and its communities to thrive. The College recently completed a strategic planning cycle and identified three strategic priorities: student success, community success, and a culture of success.
- OV5 The primary decision-making body is the President's Advisory Council (PAC), consisting of the President, the area administrators, and the three academic deans. Bay College reports a highly participative leadership culture, with several cross-functional committees such as the Instructional Leadership Team and the AtD Core Team.

Here are what the Systems Appraisal Team identified as Bay de Noc Community College's most important strengths and opportunities for improvement relating to processes encompassed by Category 5, Leading and Communicating.

Item	S/O	Comment
5P1	S	Bay College engaged in an extensive strategic planning process in 2009-2010 that resulted in a new statement of purpose, vision, mission, and values to guide the institution. The inclusive process included input from employees, the President's Advisory Council (PAC), and external stakeholders.
5P2	S	Bay College uses AQIP and AtD principles to drive continuous improvement, using multiple means to discern the needs of constituents.

departmental, and individual levels should strengthen employees' commitment to the institution and facilitate goal attainment. 5P5a S The PAC is the primary decision-making group; additional teams such as the Instructional Leaders Team and the AtD Core Team can make recommendations to PAC and have autonomy to operate and delegate as appropriate. 5P5b 0 It is not clear how the PAC, committees, and task forces at Bay College execute decisions and communicate with one another, or whether decisions are systematically shared with employees who are not associated with those groups. 5P6a S The Portfolio describes several examples of data-informed decision making, such as improvements in the advising system and the process for academic program review. 5P6b 0 The Portfolio does not always make clear how data are analyzed and whether they are available and accessible throughout the campus. Developing a common data set and procedures for systematic analysis will support informed decision making, improve efficiency, and eliminate redundant databases. 5P8a S The Bay College leadership has systematically communicated the strategic agenda to all employees. They have articulated and defined 'student success,' and this concept has been incorporated into student learning opportunities (e.g., On Course) and employee professional development opportunities. 5P8b 0 Bay College is beginning to communicate its new mission, vision, values, and goals to external stakeholders. The Portfolio does not articulate how or when Bay College will update these stakeholders on progress made toward meeting its goals.

The three-tier approach to aligning goals at the organizational.

5P10	0	It does not appear that Bay College has developed a leadership succession plan, an issue also noted in the previous Systems Appraisal Report.
5R1	S	Multiple years of data are available from Noel-Levitz SSI and annual Employee Satisfaction Surveys. Positive trends are reported in each of the four SSI questions associated with leading and communicating.
5R2	0	Bay College has an opportunity to set performance targets in important areas. Table 5-1 notes improvement in <u>student</u> satisfaction from 2007 to 2009; however, <u>employee</u> satisfaction data in Table 5-2 show declines from 2009 to 2010. Multiple year results do not show positive gain, and the Portfolio does not provide an analysis or describe actions taken to improve ratings.
5R3a	S	Bay College utilizes national comparison data for benchmarking. SSI data indicate that Bay College students are more satisfied with communication than students at peer colleges; ESS results are comparable with results of a similar survey at Lake Michigan College.
5R3b	0	Bay College uses SSI gap scores for comparison with peer institutions (see Table 5-3); however, the same approach was not taken with the data in Tables 5-1 and 5-2, in which Bay College evaluated only its own performance data. In addition, Bay College recognizes the need to further compare Employee Satisfaction results with other institutions.
511	S	Improvements in this category include distribution of PAC highlights, the ESS process, posting/emailing of Board and committee minutes, installation of a VoIP phone system, and employee professional development.
512	S	Bay College appears to be utilizing AtD to integrate principles into the institutional culture. A new balanced scorecard has been developed to monitor key performance indicators and includes a series of target ranges.

AQIP CATEGORY 6: SUPPORTING INSTITUTIONAL OPERATIONS

Supporting Institutional Operations addresses the variety of your institutional support processes that help to provide an environment in which learning can thrive. It examines your institution's processes and systems related to student support, administrative support, identification of needs, contribution to student learning and accomplishing other distinctive objectives, day-to-day operations, use of data, measures, analysis of results, and efforts to continuously improve these areas.

Here are the Key Critical Characteristics of Bay de Noc Community College that were identified by the Systems Appraisal Team as most relevant for its interpretation of its Systems Portfolio section covering Category 6, Supporting Institutional Operations:

Item Critical Characteristic

OV6 Bay College enhances student success through an extensive orientation program for new students, supplemental instruction, intrusive advising, the Learning Resource Center, the Student Success Office, the TRiO Center, and the Math/Science Center.

Here are what the Systems Appraisal Team identified as Bay de Noc Community College's most important strengths and opportunities for improvement relating to processes encompassed by Category 6, Supporting Institutional Operations.

Item	S/O	Comment
6P1a	S	Bay College identifies student support service needs through the Noel-Levitz Student Satisfaction Inventory, Idea Boxes, and other surveys. External stakeholders provide feedback via program advisory boards and strategic planning workshops. These data have been used to improve services, enhance career advising, and justify the need for additional staffing.
6P1b	0	The Portfolio indicates the need for more intentional, systematic information gathering. The College has an opportunity to go beyond surveys and informal communications to identify the support service needs of students and other key stakeholder groups, including areas not covered in the surveys.

6P2	S	The Portfolio describes numerous formal and informal processes to identify and address the support service needs of employees, including the annual Employee Satisfaction Survey.
6P3	S	Although Bay College does not have a dedicated campus security staff, it has developed an emergency response system that uses trained employees in each building, a daily contact administrator, and enhanced communication technologies.
6P4	0	Support service processes are managed by the individuals reporting to a PAC-level supervisor. Although recent improvements have been made, the Portfolio focuses on the hierarchy of the reporting structure rather than the processes the managers use to ensure that the service objectives are met.
6R1-6R5	00	Bay College recognizes that it does not have adequate data related to administrative and organizational support processes. In addition, the Portfolio does not provide statistical significance for the reported data. Going beyond satisfaction data, the College would benefit from systematically collecting data to evaluate the effectiveness of services and to identify strengths and opportunities for improvement.
6R2a	S	Bay College improved student satisfaction on the Noel-Levitz Student Satisfaction Inventory in each of the support service categories between 2007 and 2009 and in seven of eleven categories on the Community College Survey of Student Engagement between 2008 and 2010.
6R2b	0	Given the recent enhancements of academic advising and career counseling mentioned in the portfolio, Bay College has an opportunity to investigate the reasons behind the drops in usage and satisfaction of these services as reported in Table 6-3. This information could support effective planning, execution and use of resources.
6R4	S	Examples of how Bay College has used data to improve college support services include the hiring of a career advisor, two full-time developmental education faculty members, and the sharp increase in the amount of professional development offered to faculty and staff.

6R5 S Bay College outperformed its peer groups on every support service item on the Student Satisfaction Inventory and the Community College Survey of Student Engagement. This information could be useful in recruiting students as well as faculty and staff, and in communicating with legislators, potential donors, and other key audiences. 611 S Bay College has nurtured a culture of continuous improvement, resulting in significant improvements in critical services such as student orientation, registration, advising, advisor training, and emergency response systems. Enhancing the effectiveness of new student orientation and advising is a good investment of institutional effort, as these processes can determine incoming students' engagement with and initial success at the College. 612 0 Although it is clear that Bay College understands the importance and benefits of quality improvement, the College also recognizes the opportunities it has in the area of data collection and analysis, and improvements based on those results. The College could consider setting performance targets in order to better understand whether the energy and resources devoted to specific improvements result in achieving the intended outcomes.

AQIP CATEGORY 7: MEASURING EFFECTIVENESS

Measuring Effectiveness examines how your institution collects, analyzes, and uses information to manage itself and to drive performance improvement. It examines your institution's processes and systems related to collection, storage, management, and use of information and data – at the institutional and departmental/unit levels; institutional measures of effectiveness; information and data alignment with institutional needs and directions; comparative information and data; analysis of information and data; effectiveness of information system and processes; measures; analysis of results; and efforts to continuously improve these areas.

Here are the Key Critical Characteristics of Bay de Noc Community College that were identified by the Systems Appraisal Team as most relevant for its interpretation of its Systems Portfolio section covering Category 7, Measuring Effectiveness:

Item Critical Characteristic

OV7 Bay College is currently upgrading its enterprise resource planning system with a new commercial product, which will enhance information storage, access, analysis, and reporting.

Here are what the Systems Appraisal Team identified as Bay de Noc Community College's most important strengths and opportunities for improvement relating to processes encompassed by Category 7, Measuring Effectiveness.

Item	S/O	Comment
7P1a	S	Bay College has enhanced its performance data as a result of its participation in the Achieving the Dream program.
7P1b-7P2a	0	While Bay College recognizes the importance of data-based decision making and makes an effort to share and promote data campus wide, it is unclear whether a systematic process exists for selecting, managing, and distributing information. The Portfolio also does not clearly describe how instructional departments participate in the College's efforts to measure effectiveness.
7P2b	S	To support planning and improvement efforts, Bay College is instituting a balanced scorecard providing key performance indicators along with stretch goals for each of its strategic objectives, comparing the College's results to those of peer institutions, and tracking results over time.
7P3	0	The Portfolio describes a pattern of ad hoc requests for data. Bay College has an opportunity to develop proactive processes for systematically and comprehensively determining department and unit needs related to the collection, storage, and accessibility of data, including benchmarking data, and performance information. Systematic processes could support effective use of the new ERP system to foster continuous quality improvement.
7P4	Ο	The Portfolio states that performance data are shared with stakeholders. However, it is unclear how data analysis is performed prior to the presentationswhether employee groups collectively analyze the data or

another body is charged with the responsibility. Robust systematic procedures employing benchmarks and/or trends will produce more usable information to be shared throughout the organization.

7P5

S

0

S

Bay College has articulated its willingness and ability to use comparative, nationally-normed and state/system-normed data as appropriate, where those data align well with Bay College's own data structures. These comparative data inform the College's steps toward evidence-based decisions.

7P6

Bay College has the opportunity to develop processes to ensure that the departments' and units' analysis of data aligns with organizational goals for instructional and non-instructional services. As more individuals have access to more data, common definitions and analysis methods are important to minimize conflicting results from the same data.

7R1-7R3 OO

Bay College recognizes the opportunity to systematically collect and analyze data regarding its institutional research systems. While the Portfolio presented compelling information related to its IT systems, Category Seven specifically references collecting, analyzing, and distributing data and information for the purpose of institutional management and performance improvement. Bay College appears to collect little or no internal or comparative data about how stakeholders other than students use or perceive information technology resources, nor does it have adequate data about the effectiveness of its processes for measuring institutional effectiveness. This information could support effective planning, execution and use of resources particularly as the new ERP system is further integrated into the College culture.

711

Tools such as framing documents, logic models, evaluation plans, and balanced scorecards are recent improvements and, along with the implementation of a new ERP system, provides a good foundation for future improvements at Bay College. The College's participation in Achieving the Dream has also played an important role in such improvements.

AQIP CATEGORY 8: PLANNING CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT

Planning Continuous Improvement examines your institution's planning processes and how your strategies and action plans are helping you achieve your mission and vision. It examines your institution's processes and systems related to institutional vision; planning; strategies and action plans; coordination and alignment of strategies and action plans; measures and performance projections; resource needs; faculty, staff, and administrator capabilities; measures; analysis of performance projections and results; and efforts to continuously improve these areas.

Here are the Key Critical Characteristics of Bay de Noc Community College that were identified by the Systems Appraisal Team as most relevant for its interpretation of its Systems Portfolio section covering Category 8, Planning Continuous Improvement:

Item Critical Characteristic

- OVc Bay College's mission is to provide quality learning opportunities that enable its students to succeed and its communities to thrive. The College recently completed a strategic planning cycle and identified three strategic priorities: student success, community success, and a culture of success.
- OV8 Regional and state economic conditions have constrained Bay College's financial, human, and physical resources, while at the same time increasing stakeholder demand for its programs and services.

Here are what the Systems Appraisal Team identified as Bay de Noc Community College's most important strengths and opportunities for improvement relating to processes encompassed by Category 8, Planning Continuous Improvement.

Item	S/O	Comment
8P1	S	Bay College has a participatory and iterative strategic planning process that requires the College to reevaluate its vision and mission every five years. The continuous identification of next steps at the unit level can maximize campus-wide investment in planning and implementation processes.
8P2	S	Bay College's sequential, time-bound, and inclusive process facilitated identification of long-term and short-term strategies. The College used

		the Achieving the Dream (AtD) program to drive many of the improvement processes, which demonstrated the use of data to make decisions.
8P3a	S	Action plans to support organizational strategies flow from the AtD, the Title III grant, AQIP, and the strategic agenda and are documented through framing documents that include a list of activities to be completed, individuals responsible for those activities, and timelines for their completion.
8P3b	Ο	Well-defined action plans exist for the College's AtD, AQIP and Title III initiatives. However, the Portfolio did not indicate that such action plans exist for other instructional or operational areas of the college.
8P4	0	While the Portfolio references the one-day strategic planning effort as 'broad engagement,' the College is encouraged to ensure that employees from across the institution are well educated about the College's directions and strategies. In addition, it is not clear how the College coordinates group memberships to ensure that each team has sufficient expertise or diverse background to move the project in the right direction.
8P5	Ο	The Portfolio does not describe a well-formulated process for identifying measures and setting targets; a risk inherent in using an <i>ad hoc</i> approach to these tasks is that the measures or targets will be overlooked.
8P6a	S	The College is active in seeking external funding for innovative initiatives and discouraging the premature dismissal of good ideas due to funding concerns.
8P6b	0	It is not clear how strategic directions hold an intentional place in the College's budgeting cycle or resource allocation decisions. Processes to coordinate selection of multiple projects could prevent duplication of effort by developing data sources that could be used across projects, avoiding inconsistent goals, and showing the interrelatedness of outcomes.
8P8	S	Bay College recognizes, and demonstrates through its actions, that professional development is a necessary cost of change and institutional growth.

8R1	00	Bay College has a significant opportunity to establish a more comprehensive culture of assessment in which measures are identified, target outcomes are specified, and data are gathered. This cycle of quality improvement will enable the College to know when it has met an institutional goal, or when redirection is needed. For example, Bay College invests heavily in professional development, so there is an opportunity to develop measurements to determine if these investments are yielding expected results.
8R2	0	The data presented show a decrease in the pass rate in developmental courses, despite efforts reported elsewhere in the Portfolio to increase these rates. An opportunity exists to investigate the processes being used to address the pass rates.
8R3	S	Bay College provides a balanced scorecard showing stretch goals and levels for monitoring or concern. In addition, measureable changes have been established for AtD follow-up interventions, along with benchmarks for several key performance indicators.
8R5	0	The planning processes described in the Portfolio are largely of recent origin. Consequently, there is an opportunity for Bay College to identify and track performance measures for their planning processes, set performance targets, and continue to refine both the planning processes and the means of evaluating the processes.
811	S	Bay College has improved its planning process through the use of a balanced scorecard, the identification of next steps, and the development of specific action plans that are part of AQIP and AtD.

AQIP CATEGORY 9: BUILDING COLLABORATIVE RELATIONSHIPS

Building Collaborative Relationships examines your institution's relationships – current and potential – to analyze how they contribute to the institution's accomplishing its mission. It examines your institution's processes and systems related to identification of key internal and external collaborative relationships; alignment of key collaborative relationships; relationship

creation, prioritization, building; needs identification; internal relationships; measures; analysis of results; and efforts to continuously improve these areas.

Here are the Key Critical Characteristics of Bay de Noc Community College that were identified by the Systems Appraisal Team as most relevant for its interpretation of its Systems Portfolio section covering Category 9, Building Collaborative Relationships:

Item Critical Characteristic

- OVc Bay College's mission is to provide quality learning opportunities that enable its students to succeed and its communities to thrive. The College recently completed a strategic planning cycle and identified three strategic priorities: student success, community success, and a culture of success.
- OV2b Bay College partners with its area communities in many ways, including four public art galleries, a theater for community productions, and athletic facilities.
- OV9 Bay College has strategically developed partnerships with several community organizations, including the Upper Peninsula Center for Educational Development (UPCED), K-12 schools, and a Local College Access Network (LCAN).

Here are what the Systems Appraisal Team identified as Bay de Noc Community College's most important strengths and opportunities for improvement relating to processes encompassed by Category 9, Building Collaborative Relationships.

Item	S/O	Comment
9P1a	S	Bay College has established mutually beneficial partnerships with
		regional campuses, adult education providers and K-12 districts, including
		Bay Middle College. Development of a Local College Access Network
		and partnerships with MIWorks are commendable. Effective relationships
		involve dialogue, staff training, data sharing, course offerings, and
		articulation.
9P1b	Ο	Although Bay College has developed relationships with multiple
		organizations, the portfolio provides no evidence of systematic processes
		to create, prioritize, and build relationships with these organizations (this
		comment also applies to Sections 9P2 and 9P5). Such processes have

		the potential to provide focus and coordination of efforts to maximize limited resources and provide opportunities to be proactive.
9P2	S	Bay College has established articulation agreements with regional four- year institutions, and actively reaches out to advisors and administrators within these institutions. In addition, program advisory committees exist with career and technical education programs focused on the skills needed by employers.
9P3-9P4	SS	Bay College has identified the criteria to select collaborative relationships with external agencies that provide services and supplies to the students and the college. These criteria include level of student demand, availability of vendors willing to start new ventures on a college campus, capacity to supply high quality service at reasonable costs, and preference for local vendors to enhance community success.
9P5	S	Bay College builds and maintains relationships with many local and state boards and agencies. As a cultural center for its community, the College offers many opportunities for community engagement and entertainment.
9P6	0	Bay College recognizes that it does not yet have a formal process for assessing how well its programs and services meet the needs of external stakeholders. By developing a more formal process, the college can more effectively serve the needs of the community, which is an important part of its strategic plan.
9P7	S	Bay College builds relationships with internal stakeholders through cross- functional teams, campus celebrations of achievement, and frequent communication to employees and students.
9R1a	S	Bay College uses the annual Employee Satisfaction Survey, the Noel- Levitz Student Satisfaction Inventory (SSI), the Community College Survey of Student Engagement (CCSSE), and the Survey of Entering Student Engagement (SENSE) as indicators of its effectiveness in building internal collaborative relationships.

9R1b	00	Bay College has an opportunity to investigate additional methods,
		including those with available comparative data, to measure its
		collaborative relationships. This especially relates to relationships with
		external organizations. This information can support effective decision
		making and use of limited resources.
911	S	Bay College has made substantial, and strategically focused,
		improvements in building collaborative relationships. These partnerships
		will hopefully enable K-12 students to enter college with stronger skills,
		and enable Bay College to recruit and retain well-prepared students.
912	0	Although Bay College chooses and builds external relationships based on
		its needs, the portfolio does not provide measurable outcomes or targets
		for assessing or prioritizing these relationships.